

1 William M. Simpich #106672
2 Attorney at Law
3 528 Grand Avenue
4 Oakland, CA 94610
5 Telephone: (415) 542-6809
6 bsimpich@gmail.com

7 Lawrence P. Schnapf
8 Schnapf LLC
9 55 E. 87th Street #8N
10 New York, New York 10128
11 Telephone: (212) 876-3189
12 Larry@schnapflaw.com

13
14 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
15 **FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
16

17 THE MARY FERRELL FOUNDATION,
18 INC.; JOSIAH THOMPSON; and GARY
19 AGUILAR,

20 Plaintiffs,

21 v.

22 JOSEPH R. BIDEN, in his official capacity as
23 President of the United States; and the
24 NATIONAL ARCHIVES AND RECORDS
25 ADMINISTRATION,

26 Defendants.
27

No. 3:22-cv-06176-RS

TABLE OF CONTENTS AND TABLE OF
AUTHORITIES RE PLAINTIFFS’
MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND
AUTHORITIES IN OPPOSITION TO
DEFENDANTS’ MOTION TO DISMISS

Date: January 18, 2024
Time: 1:30 pm
Dept: Hon. Richard Seeborg

28 ///

///

///

///

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

1		
2		
3	I. A SUMMARY OF THE THEORIES UNADDRESSED IN	
4	DEFENDANT’S MOTION	2
5	II. PLAINTIFFS SEEK COURT FINDINGS AND ORDERS REGARDING	
6	THEORIES MOSTLY UNADDRESSED IN DEFENDANT’S MOTION	3
7	III. NARA PROVIDED IMPROPER STANDARDS TO THE PRESIDENT	4
8	IV. NARA GOT THE BEST OF BOTH WORLDS – THE PRESIDENT	
9	POSTPONED RELEASE BASED ON SECTION 5(g)(2)(D), WHILE NARA	
10	PROVIDED ITS RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE PRESIDENT BASED ON	
11	SECTION 6 AND WATERED-DOWN, NON-STATUTORY STANDARDS	5
12	V. ANALYSIS OF THE LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK OF SECTIONS	
13	5, 6 AND 9	7
14	VI. ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS MUST BE REVIEWED,	
15	TRANSMITTED AND DISCLOSED, IN ORDER TO COMPLETE	
16	THE COLLECTION	8
17	A. NARA has a duty to certify that all assassination records have been	
18	made available to the public.	8
19	B. NARA has mandatory duties to review, obtain, and transmit all	
20	assassination records.	10
21	VII. PLAINTIFFS’ THREE CAUSES OF ACTION ARE PROPER	11
22	A. Plaintiffs’ First Cause of Action properly alleges that the Biden Memos	
23	expressly violate the JFK Act.	11
24	B. Plaintiffs’ Second Cause of Action properly states that the Defendant	
25	has a Section 6 duty to release the names and identities of individuals and a	
26	Section 12 duty to complete outstanding records searches and continue to	
27	collect records until “all assassination records have been obtained”.	12
28	1. NARA’s mandatory duties are spelled out in the Second	
	Cause of Action.	12
	2. NARA’s continuing duty to obtain “assassination records”	
	pursuant to the JFK Records Act.	14
	3. Sections 5, 6 and 9 provide a “siloe d structure”	14

1	a. The court issued no final opinion on the continued vitality of periodic review.	14
2		
3	b. The Transparency Plans fail to mention the “legally required” periodic reviews by NARA and the agencies, which constitutes “failure to act” under 551(13).	16
4		
5		
6	4. Agency action is the failure to act on an agency rule	17
7		
8	5. NARA has a mandatory duty to conduct periodic review under Section 9(d)(2).	17
9		
10	6. Event-based or circumstance-based review is not periodic.	18
11		
12	7. Differing interpretations with no explanation are arbitrary and capricious.	18
13		
14	8. As confederates and associates of NARA, nonparties such as CIA and DOD can be ordered by this court to revise their Transparency Plans	20
15	C. On the Third Cause of Action, Plaintiffs have a long list of Destroyed, Missing, and Removed Records pursuant to the Federal Records Act	21
16	1. Defendant’s argument	21
17		
18	2. Investigators can rarely determine if the documents absent from the files is “missing, destroyed, or removed”	21
19		
20	3. Previous versions of the complaint seek “missing” and “destroyed” documents.	21
21		
22	4. Defendant’s claim that “removal” is not the same as “missing” is unreasonable.	22
23		
24	5. The Joannides and Marcello documents have been “removed” in a special way.	22
25		
26	6. The Plaintiffs should be allowed to conduct discovery to prove their claim.	23
27	CONCLUSION	26
28		

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

CASES

1		
2		
3		
4	<i>ACLU v. Dep't of Def.</i> , 351 F. Supp. 265 (S.D.N.Y. 2005)	25
5	<i>ACLU of Florida v. ICE</i> , 2023 WL 6461053	21, 26
6	<i>Alemite Mfg. Co. v. Staff</i> , 42 F.2d 832 (2 nd Cir. 1930)	21
7	<i>American Friends Service Committee v. Webster</i> , 720 F. 29 (D.C. Cir. 1983)	23
8	<i>Armstrong v. Bush</i> , 924 F.2d 282 (DCA 1991)	23
9	<i>Bothwell v. CIA</i> , 2014 LEXIS 144151 (N.D.C)	
10	<i>Cause of Action Inst. v. Pompeo</i> , 319 F.Supp. 3d 230 (D.D.C. 2018)	21
11	<i>Chase National Bank v. City of Norwalk</i> , 291 U.S. 431 (1934)	20
12	<i>Children's Hosp. & Health Center v. Belshe</i> , 188 F.3d 1090 (9 th Cir. 1999)	2, 10
13	<i>Citizens for Responsibility & Ethics in Wash. v. Exec. Office of the President</i> , 587 F.Supp.2d 48 (D.D.C. 2008)	23, 25
14		
15	<i>Hells Canyon Pres. Council v. U.S. Forest Service</i> , 593 F.3d 923 (9 th Cir. 2010)	2
16	<i>Lujan v. Defs. of Wildlife</i> , 504 US 555 (1992)	21
17	<i>M.S. v. Brown</i> , 902 F.3d 1076 (9 th Cir. 2018)	21
18		
19	<i>Norton v. Southern Utah Wilderness All.</i> , 542 U.S. 55 (2004)	2, 17
20	<i>Plaskett v. Wormuth</i> , 18 F.4 th 1072 (9 th Cir. 2021)	9
21	<i>Valencia-Lucena v. US Coast Guard, FOIA/PA Records</i> , 180 F.3d 321 (DCA, 1999)	26
22	<i>Wildearth Guardians v. Chao</i> , 454, F.Supp.3d 944 (D. Mont. 2020)	17
23		
24		
25	STATUTES	
26	President John F. Kennedy Assassination Records Collection Act of 1992, 44 U.S.C. Section 2107, note	<i>passim</i>
27		
28	§2(a)	19
	§2(a)(1)	3, 8, 10

1		
2	§2(a)(3)	13
3	§3(10)	12, 16, 19
4	§4	10
5	§5	3-4, 6-7, 10, 15, 19-20
6	§5(c)(2)(F)	4, 8, 10, 14
7		
8	§5(c)(2)(H)	4, 8, 10, 14
9	§5(g)(1)	7, 9, 15
10	§5(g)(2)(A)	14-15
11	§5(g)(2)(D)	3-7, 11, 14-16, 20
12		
13	§6	3, 5-8, 11-13, 15-17, 19
14	§6(3)	4, 20
15	§6(4)	18
16	§7	4, 9
17		
18	§7(i)	10
19	§7(j)(1)(C)(2)	4, 8, 10, 14
20	§8	9
21	§9	3
22	§9(c)(1)	11
23	§9(c)(3)(B)	7
24		
25	§9(d)	6, 15-17
26	§9(d)(1)	16
27	§9(d)(2)	3, 6-7, 9, 15, 18
28	§11(a)	3

1		
2	§12	12-13
3	§12(a)	9
4	§12(b)	2-5, 8-10, 13-14
5	5 U.S.C. 551(13)	2, 15, 17
6	5 U.S.C. 706(1)	2, 15, 17
7		
8	5 U.S.C. 706(2)(A)	19

9
10 **Regulations**

11	36 C.F.R. 1290.1	10
12	65 FR 39550	10

13
14 **Presidential Memoranda**

15	2022 Biden Memo, Section 6	5, 12, 20
16	2023 Biden Memo	6

17 **Previous Ruling**

18	Order of 7/14/23, ECF 68	2-3, 6-8, 11-12, 14-16, 22
----	--------------------------	----------------------------

19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28